JOSEPH J. MURATORE, S.C.

February 14, 2007

Mr. Robert K. Weber City Attorney City Hall 730 Washington Avenue Racine. Wisconsin 53403

Re:

Properties of Racine County Housing Authority

Payment In Lieu of Taxes ("Pilot") Review

Dear Mr. Weber:

We have continued our PILOT payment review of the various properties owned by the Racine County Housing Authority ("RCHA"). This letter contains a summary of the information obtained from RCHA.

RCHA has indicated that it owns the following properties in the City of Racine:

1616 Prospect Street (single family)

1911 Linden Avenue (single family)

107 Riverside Drive (single family)

602 Randolph Street (single family)

1619 Franklin Street (four family - handicapped occupancy)

2900 Russet Street (four family - handicapped occupancy)

837 Main Street (RCHA main offices)

PILOT PAYMENTS FOR SINGLE FAMILY PROPERTIES

Each of the single family properties owned by RCHA is subject to a rent to purchase agreement, copies of which are enclosed herewith. The PILOT payment formula for the single family properties is set forth in a Cooperation Agreement dated December 20, 1977 between the City and RCHA, a copy of which is enclosed herewith ("Cooperation Agreement"). In summary, the PILOT formula for each single family property is ten (10%) of the difference between the yearly rentals paid by the tenant of each property to RCHA minus the cost of any utilities paid by RCHA for said property.

FEB 16 2007

Mr. Robert K. Weber February 12, 2007 Page 2

Enclosed is a copy of a spreadsheet, based on information provided by RCHA, that shows the calculation of the PILOT payments that RCHA claims were made to the City for the single family properties from 2000 through 2006. RCHA indicated that it does not pay any utility expenses for the single family properties. The tenant of each single family property pays all the utility expenses for the property occupied by the tenant. Thus, the PILOT payments for each single family property, based on the Cooperation Agreement, would be simply 10% of the yearly rental payments received by RCHA.

Mr. Charles Smith of the Milwaukee office of the United States Department of Housing and Urban Development ("HUD") indicated to us that in order for RCHA to receive HUD funds for the purchase of low income housing, the PILOT payments must be based on the actual rent received by RCHA from the occupant of the property. Mr. Smith further indicated that the operating subsidy received by RCHA from the federal government is not to be considered as "rent" received by RCHA in determining the PILOT amount.

Based on our review of the rent to purchase agreements and the PILOT payments that RCHA claims it has made to the City, it appears that RCHA has paid the total PILOT payments on the single family properties required under the Cooperation Agreement from 2000 through 2006. The above conclusion assumes that the City can verify that it actually received the PILOT payments that RCHA claims were made on the single family properties from 2000 through 2006 (as shown in the above-referenced spreadsheet).

PILOT PAYMENTS FOR MULTI-FAMILY PROPERTIES

The Cooperation Agreement also expressly applies to eight (8) units constructed for handicapped individuals. That would include the properties on Franklin and Russet Streets. RCHA indicates that it has been making PILOT payments to the City on the Franklin and Russet Street properties using the formula in the Cooperation Agreement. A spreadsheet prepared by RCHA showing the PILOT payment calculations for the years 2001 through 2006 is enclosed. RCHA directly pays the utility expenses on the multi-family properties (unlike the single family properties).

Based on our review of the information provided to us by RCHA, it appears that RCHA has paid the PILOT payments to the City on the multi-family properties

Mr. Robert K. Weber February 12, 2007 Page 3

required under the Cooperation Agreement from 2001 through 2006. The above conclusion assumes that the City can verify that: (i) from 2001 through 2006 it actually received the PILOT payment amounts that RCHA claims were made on the multi-family properties, and (ii) the actual leases for the multi-family properties contain the lease rates that RCHA has provided to us. We have not reviewed the actual leases for the units in the Franklin and Russet Street properties to verify that the revenue shown in the above-referenced spreadsheet for those properties approximates the rental rates in said leases. Let us know if the City desires that we review the leases.

PILOT PAYMENTS FOR OFFICE OF RCHA

RCHA does not make any property tax or PILOT payments on its office at 837 Main Street. Wisconsin Statutes Section 66.1201(22) sets forth the tax exemption for RCHA's properties. That section provides:

The property of an authority is public property used for essential public and governmental purposes and the property and an authority are exempt from all taxes of the state or any state public body, except that the city in which a **project or projects** are located may fix a sum to be paid annually in lieu of taxes by the authority for the services, improvements or facilities furnished to the **property** of the authority by the city ... (emphasis supplied)

Housing projects are essentially defined in Wisconsin Statutes Section 66.1201(3)(j) as housing to provide dwellings for low income persons.

The language of Section 66.1201(22) expressly indicates that payments in lieu of taxes may be fixed for services, improvements or facilities furnished to the "property" of the authority by the City. Note that the statute, in describing the PILOT exemption, uses the broader word "property" instead of the words "project" or "projects". That leads to the conclusion that PILOT payments can be fixed for all "property" of an authority, not just the authority's "projects". Based on the foregoing, it is our opinion that PILOT payments can be fixed for RCHA's office property. If the City desires to obtain PILOT payments for RCHA's office property, it should enter into negotiations with RCHA for an agreement to fix the

Mr. Robert K. Weber February 12, 2007 Page 4

amount of the PILOT payments for the office property. If requested, we would be willing to assist the City in such negotiations.

When we were originally assigned this matter, the City was not aware that the Cooperation Agreement existed. In calling for a review of the PILOT payments made by RCHA, there was also a desire to negotiate a PILOT agreement with RCHA using the formula contained in PILOT Agreements executed by the City in the relatively recent past. It is our opinion that the Cooperation Agreement is a continuing binding obligation of the City and governs the PILOT payments for the housing projects currently owned by RCHA.

Please let us know if the City desires further assistance from our firm in regard to this matter.

If you have any questions, please contact us.

Yours very truly,

Law Offices, Joseph J. Muratore, S.C.

Keld, Muratore J...
Voseph J. Muratore Jr.

enclosures

Payment in Lieu of Taxes (PILOT)
Housing Authority of Racine County
2000 - 2008

		Totals 17,141.36 17,140.27 17,229.58 14,795.67 15,263.46 14,755.37	110,941.58	(G)		10,987.41
	Total	4,211.16 4,211.17 4,211.17 3,563.17 3,562.72 3,562.72	27,042.91 \$:	5
	Mtg Int	1,930.26 1,863.77 1,794.53 1,722.45 1,647.45 1,569.42	,12,016.06	\$ 27,042.91 × 10% \$ 2,704.29	368.52 368.52 368.52 368.52 368.52 368.52 368.52	2,579.64
602 Pandolph	Mtg Prin	2,280.90 2,347.40 2,416.64 1,840.72 2,073.49 1,993.30 2,074.40	15,026.85	w ^ ω	· [€9
- 	Total	3,682.15 3,682.14 3,682.14 3,054.15 3,054.12 3,054.12	23,398.22			
	Mtg Int	1,654,54 1,597.51 1,538.16 1,476.39 1,412.12 1,345.21 1,275.60	10,299.53	\$ 23,398.22 × 10% \$ 2,339.82	248.16 248.16 248.16 248.16 248.16 248.16 248.16	1,737.12
107 Riverside	Mtg Prin	2,027,61 2,084,63 2,143,98 1,577,76 1,777,26 1,708,91	13,098.69	φ × φ		69
-	Total	4,046.40 4,045.73 4,045.23 3,417.73 3,569.07 3,558.01 3,417.73	26,099.90			
	Mtg Int	1,851.50 1,787.69 1,721.27 1,580.23 1,580.23 1,505.36	11,525.64	x 10% x 10% 2,609.99	226.15 225.15 225.15 225.15 225.15 225.15 225.15	1,5/6.05
1911 Linden	Mtg Prin	2,194.90 2,258.04 2,323.96 1,765.58 1,988.84 2,052.65 1,990.29	14,574.26	φ ^ φ		A
1	Total	5,201.65 5,201.23 5,291.04 4,760.82 4,784.07 4,580.52 4,581.22	34,400.55			
speci	Mtg int	2,481.82 2,396.27 2,307.24 2,214.57 2,118.17 2,233.21 1,913.40	15,664.68	\$ 34,400.55 × 10% \$ 3,440.06	727.80 727.80 727.80 727.80 727.80 727.80	20,500,0
Dadsor Loro	Mtg Prin	2,719.83 2,804.96 2,983.80 2,546.25 2,665.90 2,347.31 2,667.82	18,735.87	φ × φ 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 10		
	Year	2000 2001 2002 2003 2004 2006		0.10%.PILOTTA	Year 2000 2001 2002 2003 2004 2005 2006 8000all/Wellion	to City of Radine

•					• •
•		1619/1621		2000	
				2900	•
		Franklin	Consumed	Russet	
		Dollars	Consumed	Dollars	Consumed
January	Gas	\$270.45	272	£200.00	
<u></u>	· Electric	\$57.81		\$269.69	261
	Sewer/Water	407.01	726	\$46.59	555
	oewel/ water				
February	Gas	£470 ar	400	A	
recrually		\$470.35	463	\$448.11	449
	Electric	\$100.49	1213	\$83.65	993
	Sewer/Water				
	_			,	
March	Gas	\$358.51	421	383.34	453
	Electric	\$98.89	1173	87.37	1026
•	Sewer/Water				
inqA	Gas	\$251.86	291	\$251.68	289
	Electric	\$102.02	1213	\$89.26	1050
	Sewer/Water .	•		\$129.60	40
May	Gas	\$109.54	127	\$98.12	114
	Electric	\$72.26	829	\$61.68	694
•	Sewer/Water	\$177.69	61	•	•
June	Gas	\$78.98	105	\$77.83	. 105
	Electric	\$72.65	828	\$88.01	1022
	Sewer/Water	•		4	1022
July	Gas	\$48.02	69	\$35,40	47
-	Electric	\$94.68	1106	\$60.43	
	Sewer/Water	40		\$379.21	149
				40.0.21	173
August	Gas	\$23.85	28	\$48.02	· 75
	Electric	\$104.19	1226	\$78.98	
	Sewer/Water	\$147,92	48	\$10.30	908
		V141.02	. 40		
Sept.	Gas	\$28.84	41	. \$11.77	-
•	Electric	\$79.77	918	\$11.77	5
•	Sewer/Water	410.11	910	\$71.45	813
	Concilitate				
Oct	Gas	\$47.21	96	640.45	444
000	Electric			\$49.15	103
		\$47.67	513	\$81.04	934
	Sewer/Water			\$ 151.87	41
Nov.	Gas	***	45-		
1404.		\$93.14	. 185	\$80.01	- 147
	Electric	\$80.25	924	\$ 63.60	714
	Sewer/Water	\$161.98	24		:
	_				
Dec. ~	Gas	\$321.23	252	\$ 345.94	249
Incl Accr	Electric	\$152.89	1134	\$ 132.46	952
	Sewer/Water	\$144.42	45	\$ 139.78	43
	_				
TOTAL	Gas	\$2,101.98	2350.0	\$2,099,06	2297
	Electric	\$1,063.57	11051.0	\$944.52	10335
	Sewer/Water	\$632.01	1351.0	\$800.46	273
		•			
GRAND TO	TALS	\$3,797.56	14752	\$3,844.04	12905
	•				
•		1619		2900	
		Franklin		Russet	
		Dollars	•	Dollars	
RENTAL INC	COME				
January		652		628	
February		652		628	
March		652		628	
April	•	652		628	
May		652		628	
June		652		628	
July		652		628	
August	•	652 652			
September				628	-
· October		652		628	
		652		628	
November		652		628	
December		681		609	
DELIT TOTAL				_	
RENT TOTAL	PRA OUIL	7853		7517	
DEL	TICO				
RENT - UTIL	HES	4055.44		3672.96	
x 10% = PILC	nt .	6405 51		****	
A 1070 - PILC	/1 .	\$405.54		\$367.30	

+ .					
*. 		1619/1621 Franklin Dollars	Consumed	2900 Russet Dollars	Consumed
January	Gas Electric Sewer/Water	\$157.60 \$55.71		\$186.53 \$52.05	
February	Gas Electric Sewen/Water	\$234.91 \$91.10	224 1061	\$245,29 \$83.42	396 96
March	Gas Electric Sewer/Water	\$242.98 \$100.70	399 1182	247.18 83.98	403 971
April	Gas Electric Sewer/Water	\$190,45 \$111,64	278 1320	. \$226.42	80
Мау	Gas Electric Sewer/Water	\$127.75 \$83.27 \$138.30	190 962 42	\$315.07 \$127.51	462 1432
June	Gas Electric Sewer/Water				
July	Gas Electric Sewer/Water	\$99.22 \$167.08	150 1931	\$80.92 \$137,91 \$374.48	117 1563 140
August	Gas Electric Sewer/Water	\$25.25 \$63.20 \$144.13	33 709 43	\$24.58 \$67.18	32 759
Sept.	Gas Electric Sewer/Water	\$29.78 \$79.45	43 914	\$28.96 \$57.41	41 636
Oct.	Gas Electric Sewer/Water	\$44.98 \$71.13	69 809	\$64.42 \$72.08 \$127.26	106 821 36
Nov.	Gas Electric Sewer/Water	\$128.36 \$99.27 \$129.67	189 1143 - 37	\$93.34 \$56.16	132 608
Dec. ~ Incl Accr	Gas Electric Sewer/Water	\$414.84 \$163.64	343 1249	\$469.65 \$149.61 \$140.31	390 1138 41
TOTAL	Gas Electric Sewer/Water	\$1,696.12 \$1,086.19 \$412.10		\$1,755.94 \$887.31 \$868.47	
GRAND TO	TALS	\$3,194.41	0	\$3,511.72	Ġ.
RENTAL INC	CÓLUE	1619 Franklin Dollars		2900 Russet Dollars	
January January March April May June June July August September October November December		681 681 670 670 670 670 670 670 670 577 577 610		609 609 456 456 691 691 691 652 691 690	
		7827		7536	
RENT - UTILI		4632.59		4024.28	

		1619/1621 Franklin Dollars	Consumed	2900 Russet Dollars	Consumed
January	Gas Electric Sewer/Water	\$156.48 \$58.93		\$184.21 \$70.60	
February	Gas Electric	•	,		
	Sewer/Water	\$125.85	35		
March	Gas Electric Sewer/Water	\$650.61 \$201.75	744 2301	684.91 188.54	779 2138
April	Gas Electric Sewer/Water	\$202.59 \$83.07	212 912	\$249.26 \$88.57 \$189.10	250 978 60
May	Gas Electric Sewer/Water	\$132.44 \$94.91 \$172.94	168 1054 53	\$95.14 \$68.64	120 739
June	Gas Electric Sewer/Water	\$94.01 \$84.07	118 924		
July	Gas Electric Sewer/Water	\$35.99 \$41.79	37 417	\$39.69 \$121.52 \$144.30	118 1289 40
August	Gas Electric Sewer/Water	\$31.48 \$62.97 \$151.18	33 671 42	\$21.38 \$66.72	18 716
Sept.	Gas Electric Sewer/Water				
Oct.	Gas Electric Sewer/Water	\$117.79 \$135.30	149 1453	\$93.09 \$115.47 \$135.94	131 1215 36
Nov.	'Gas Electric Sewer/Water	\$129.72 \$78.56 \$151.18	176 855	\$104.26 \$63.66	135 677
Dec Incl Accr	Gas Electric Sewer/Water	\$392.18 \$144.45 \$162.80	281 1045	\$665.54 \$203.74 \$127.24	740 1582 31
TOTAL	Gas Electric Sewer/Water	\$1,943.29 \$985.80 \$763.95		\$2,137.48 \$987.46 \$596.58	: .•
GRAND TO	TALS	\$3,693.04	0	\$3,721.52	0

	1619			
	Franklin	Russet		
•	Dollars	Dollars		
RENTAL INCOME				
January	610	692		
February	610	691		
· March	610	691		
April	505	690		
` May	705	692		
June	605	456		
July	605	594.		
August	505	595		
September	705	454		
October	605	677		
November	448	678		
December	645	729		
RENT TOTAL BY UNIT	7158	7639		
RENT-UTILITIES	3464.96	3917.48		
About Du Am				

		1619/1621 Franklin Dollars	Consumed	2900 Russet Dollars	Consumed
January	Electric Gas Sewer/Water	\$56,92 \$190,27		\$65.93 \$281.79	
February	Electric Gas Sewer/Water	\$102.41 \$380.10	1140 420	\$91.61 \$426.62	101 47
March	Electric Gas Sewer/Water	\$86.43 \$259.70	949 287	134.25 349.28	137 ⁻ 39 ⁻
April	Electric Gas Sewer/Water	\$85.25 \$181.75	935 204	\$65.83 \$167.51 \$137.60	703 188 33
May	Electric Gas Sewer/Water	\$78.25 \$112.48 \$126.34	841 129 28		
June	Electric Gas Sewer/Water	\$83.08 \$70.57	883 77	\$123.68 \$159.52	1282 177
July	Electric Gas Sewer/Water	\$73.26 \$40.57	769 40	\$56.71 \$38.79 \$133.57	577 38 29
August	Electric Gas Sewer/Water	\$70.15 \$32.10 \$187.42	725 30 47	\$51.57 \$32.87	511 31
Sept.	Electric Gas Sewer/Water	\$69.17 \$33.06	710 33	\$56.11 \$35.63	562 37
Oct.	Electric Gas Sewer/Water	\$75.33 \$59.59	793 72	\$64.20 \$69.02 \$153.10	606 85 35
Nov.	Electric Gas Sewer/Water	\$82.40 \$140.28 \$155.96	902 152 36	\$13.77	91
Dec. ~ Incl Accr	Electric Gas Sewer/Water	\$169.63 \$519.87 \$150.24	1133	\$198.92 \$632.26	1698 497
TOTAL	Electric Gas Sewer/Water	\$1,032.28 \$2,020.34 \$619.96		\$922.58 \$2,193.29 \$424.27	
GRAND TOT	ALS	\$3,672.58	0	\$3,540.14	0
RENTAL INC	OME	1619 Franklin Dollars		2900 Russet Dollars	
January		488		729	
February		488		727	
March		488		707	
April May		751 764		727	
viay June		751 761		727 727	
July		751		727 783	
August		751		783	
September		599		783	
October November		903		585	
vovember December		751 773		585 564	
RENT TOTAL	BY UNIT	8255		8427	
RENT - UTILIT	nes ·	4582.42		4886.86	
10% = PILO	• :	\$ 458.24 .		\$488.69	area in the

	·	1619/1621 Franklin Dollars	Consumed	2900 Russet Dollars	Consumed
January	Electric Gas Sewer/Water	\$63.91 \$231.38		\$57.74 \$293.52	
February	Electric Gas Sewer/Water	\$107.89 \$348.90 \$167.40		\$94.80 \$418.96	1019 442
March	Electric Gas Sewer/Water	\$103.25 \$351.48	1117 367		
lingA.	Electric Gas Sewer/Water	\$101.41 \$222.84	1042 224	\$ 155.63	33
May	Electric Gas Sewer/Water	\$86.05 \$159.88 \$172.51	871 165 37	\$145.56 \$521.21	1486 534
June	Electric Gas Sewer/Water	\$82.36 \$84.94	809 93	\$119.50 (\$114.26)	1147 235
July	Electric Gas Sewer/Water	\$70.46 \$40.99	680 39	•	
August	Electric			\$188.66	42
ragust	Gas Sewer/Water	\$ 182.20	40	\$50.58 \$37.28	467 34
Sept.	Electric	-	.,	****	
Зерс	Gas Sewer/Water	\$132.53 \$75.42	1270 60	\$105.57 \$80.20	981 64
Oct	Electric Gas Sewer/Water	\$74.85 \$89.63	727 68	\$55.90 \$95.79 \$240.34	524 72
Nov.	Electric Gas Sewer/Water	\$84,38 \$183,39 \$195,12	829 135 44	\$67.87 \$248.02	652 185
Dec. ~ Incl Accr	Electric Gas Sewer/Water	\$236.71 \$835.96	2375 758	\$208.24 \$305.73	907 273
TOTAL	Electric Gas Sewer/Water	\$1,143.80 \$2,624.81 \$717.23		\$905.76 \$1,886.45 \$584.63	
GRAND TOT	ALS	\$4,485.84	0	\$3,376.84	0
RENTAL INC	OME	1619 Franklin Dollars		2900 Russet Dollars	
January February		759		745	
March		766 766		750 745	
April May		593		745	1 .
May June		834 844		750 748	
July		757		746 745	
 August September 		757 757		750	
October		757 757		740 736	
November		757		750 750	
December		773		679	
RENT TOTAL		9120		8883	
RENT - UTILIT		4634.16		5506.16	
x 10% = PILO	To the State of th	\$463.42		\$550.62	

		1619/1621 Franklin		2900 Russet	
•		Dollars	Consumed	Dollars	Consumed
January	Electric Gas Sewer/Water	\$117.66 \$414.24	1179 372	\$92.12 \$305.73	90 27
February	Electric	\$108.94	1013		92
	Gas Sewer/Water	\$385.49 \$193.21	340 39	\$464.71	409
March	Electric	\$ 116.35	1055	200,51	1813
	Gas Sewer/Water	\$414.92	362	406.26	120
April	Electric	\$108.62	972	\$80.82	. 70
•	Gas Sewer/Water	\$269.73	238	\$308.97 \$288.13	27 <u>.</u> 67
May	Electric	\$90.42	803	\$62.14	528
	Gas Sewer/Water	\$156.64	144	\$142.37	. 131
June	Electric	\$80.10	700	\$58.32	483
	Gas Sewer/Water	\$93.22 \$155.92	89 28	\$59.65	54
July	Electric	\$88.36	720	\$ 49.75	405
·	Gas Sewer/Water	\$55.81	51	\$32.87	27
August	Electric	\$69.85	603	\$116.21	960
- 110	Gas Sewer/Water	\$32.16 \$176.26	27 34	\$30.22 \$233.89	25 \$51.00
Sept.	Electric	\$72.69	628		•
Осри.	Gas Sewer/Water	\$33.40	29	\$80.23 \$34.79	160498 30
Oct.	Electric	\$83.11	852	(\$7.64)	561
•	Gas Sewer/Water	\$100.59	118	\$74.45 \$186.43	88 37
Nov.	Electric	\$104.22	937	\$80.35	705
~*	Gas Sewer/Water	\$173.35 \$166.09	204 31	\$168,52	192
Dec. ~	Electric	\$112,47	1012	\$100.46	890
Incl Accr	Gas Sewer/Water	\$324.36	300	\$332.78 \$163.70	306 30
TOTAL	Electric	\$1,152.79		\$913.27	
	Gas - Sewer/Water	\$2,453.91 \$691.48		\$2,361.32 \$ 872.15	
GRAND TO	TALS	\$4,298.18	0	\$4,146.74	0
	•	1619		2900	
		Franklin Dollars		Russet Dollars	
RENTAL INC January	COME	768		672	
February		769	• .	673 676	
March		784		676	
April May		806 801		676 676	
June		801		539	
July		636		539	
August September		794		704 705	
October		800 800	,	705 480	
November		800		932	
December		869		. 739	
RENT TOTA		9428		8015	*
RENT - UTIL	* *	5129.82	::	3868.26	<i>:</i> ·
x 10% = PILC	OT	\$512.98	·	\$386.83	