

Purchasing Department

Sam J. Aiello, C.P.M.
Purchasing Agent



City Hall
730 Washington Avenue
Racine, Wisconsin 53403
(262) 636-9143
Fax: (262) 636-9100

Honorable Mayor Tom Friedel and the
Members of the Common Council
730 Washington Avenue
Racine, WI 53403

March 4, 2009

Ladies and Gentlemen:

Bids were taken for Official Notice #2, TWO (2) THREE WHEEL BROOM TYPE STREET SWEEPERS in the office of the Purchasing Agent on Friday, February 20, 2009 at 10:00 A.M. CST. Bids were as follows:

RNOW	Does not meet all specifications
2009 Allianz Johnston 3000SP	W/O Trades \$324,590
	With trades \$286,590 (trade values \$38,000)
Bruce Municipal Equipment	Meets all specifications
2009 Elgin Pelican P	W/O trades \$315,920
	With trades \$295,920 (trade values \$20,000)
RNOW	Does not meet all specifications
2009 Allianz Johnston MX450	W/O Trades \$345,730
	With trades \$307,730 (trade values \$38,000)

This bid has been reviewed with Nick Becker of DPW Equipment Maintenance. Mr. Becker performed a maintenance review on the Johnston sweepers the City has purchased in the past. The Total Cost of Ownership of the Johnston product far exceeds the Total Cost of Ownership we have experienced with the Elgin sweeper. I have attached Nick Becker's data to this submittal.

It is our recommendation that we award this bid to Bruce Municipal Equipment at their bid price with trades of \$295,920 that being in the best interest of the City.

Funds for this expenditure are available in account 104.000.5790, Unlicensed Vehicles.

Respectfully Submitted,

Sam J. Aiello
Purchasing Agent

Cc: Rick Jones
Nick Becker

Aiello, Sam

From: Becker, Nicholas
Sent: Tuesday, March 03, 2009 4:40 PM
To: Aiello, Sam
Cc: Jones, Richard
Subject: Street Sweepers Bids
Attachments: 0084_0001.pdf; oledata.mso



**CITY OF RACINE
DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS
EQUIPMENT MAINTENANCE DIVISION**

MEMO

TO: Sam Aiello
CC: Rick Jones
FROM: Nick Becker
RE: 2009 Street Sweeper Bids
DATE: March 3, 2009

I have reviewed the Bidder's Proposals for the two (2) Three Wheel Broom Type Street Sweepers we received on February 20, 2009. The results are as follows:

RNOW 2009 Allianz Johnston 3000SP	Does not meet all specifications W/O Trades \$324,590 With trades \$286,590 (trade values \$38,000)
Bruce Municipal Equipment 2009 Elgin Pelican P	Meets all specifications W/O trades \$315,920 With trades \$295,920 (trade values \$20,000)
RNOW 2009 Allianz Johnston MX450	Does not meet all specifications W/O Trades \$345,730 With trades \$307,730 (trade values \$38,000)

Although the Allianz Johnston 3000SP sweepers are less expensive upfront, the cost to operate them is much higher than the Elgin models. I reviewed of the operational cost for our sweepers and found the Elgin models costs \$19.41 per hour to operate and the Johnston is \$25.30 per hour.

Based on a 10,000 hour service life for our sweepers, the additional \$5.89 per hour operating cost for the Johnston model would result in an additional \$58,900 per sweeper or \$117,800 for both sweepers over their service life. These results are similar to the review conducted in 2006 when the last sweeper was purchased. The statistics for both comparisons are attached for your review.

The operational efficiencies gained by the Elgin sweepers more than exceeds the additional \$9,330 upfront cost. Furthermore, the Johnston sweepers have a history of parts supply problems and slow response on warranty issues

resulting in extended out of service times. It is my recommendation that we purchase the Elgin Pelican P sweepers from Bruce Municipal Equipment.

Should you have any questions or concerns please contact me.

City of Racine Fleet Services
 Equipment Cost Summary by Chassis Make for the Life-To-Date

Equipment#	Part	Cost(\$)							Total Cost(\$)/ Usage(1)
		In-House Labor	Outside Repair	Fuel	Total	Road Calls	Usage(1)	Fuel Econ	
ELGIN (7 Equipment#s)									
56092	\$42,078.51	\$74,497.25	\$0.00	\$9,647.62	\$126,223.38	0	4808	1.11	\$26.25
56093	\$33,319.26	\$65,794.00	\$39.17	\$13,699.51	\$112,851.94	0	5004	1.29	\$22.55
56094	\$8,684.09	\$14,935.00	\$0.00	\$7,299.13	\$30,918.22	1	1478	1.48	\$20.92
56095	\$19,671.08	\$31,343.00	\$829.77	\$13,100.25	\$64,944.10	6	3500	1.31	\$18.56
56097	\$35,576.53	\$69,086.25	\$467.73	\$17,419.65	\$122,550.16	0	7733	1.15	\$15.85
56098	\$9,808.77	\$20,679.00	\$73.16	\$9,572.02	\$40,132.95	5	1989	1.55	\$20.18
56099	\$25,996.47	\$40,472.50	\$1,042.49	\$17,361.58	\$84,873.04	1	5498	1.37	\$15.44
Total ELGIN (7 Equipment#s)									
	\$175,134.71	\$316,807.00	\$2,452.32	\$88,099.76	\$582,493.79	13	30,010	1.27	\$19.41
JOHNSTON (1 Equipment#)									
56091	\$26,395.07	\$31,926.50	\$233.75	\$18,606.28	\$77,161.60	0	3050	2.06	\$25.30
Total JOHNSTON (1 Equipment#)									
	\$26,395.07	\$31,926.50	\$233.75	\$18,606.28	\$77,161.60	0	3,050	2.06	\$25.30
Grand Total									
	\$201,529.78	\$348,733.50	\$2,686.07	\$106,706.04	\$659,655.39	13	33,060	1.34	\$19.95

City of Racine Fleet Services
 Equipment Cost Summary by Chassis Make for the Life-To-Date

Equipment#	In-House		Outside Repair	Fuel	Total	Road Calls	Usage(1)	Fuel Econ	Total
	Part	Labor							Cost(\$)/ Usage(1)
ELGIN (5 Equipment#s)									
56092	34,200.05	57,034.50	0.00	6,187.16	97,421.71	0	3727	1.09	26.14
56093	21,413.71	36,804.00	0.00	6,676.58	64,894.29	0	3338	1.23	19.44
56095	3,875.08	3,757.50	0.00	2,588.10	10,220.68	0	1031	1.22	9.91
56097	21,050.82	40,574.25	34.15	8,530.53	70,189.55	0	5244	1.13	13.38
56099	9,622.38	17,370.00	0.00	6,899.59	33,891.97	1	2901	1.40	11.68
Total ELGIN (5 Equipment#s)	90,161.84	155,540.25	34.15	30,881.96	276,618.20	1	16,241	1.19	17.03
JOHNSTON (3 Equipment#s)									
56091	1,361.20	3,240.00	0.00	1,934.58	6,535.78	0	400	2.05	16.34
56094	26,466.70	48,246.00	25.00	8,558.55	83,296.25	1	2644	2.23	31.50
56096	33,159.15	56,145.75	0.00	9,984.80	99,289.70	1	4026	1.69	24.66
Total JOHNSTON (3 Equipment#s)	60,987.05	107,631.75	25.00	20,477.93	189,121.73	2	7,070	1.91	26.75
Grand Total	151,148.89	263,172.00	59.15	51,359.89	465,739.93	3	23,311	1.41	19.98